



February 28

2022

REPORT OF THE HEALTH AND SAFETY COMMITTEE

The Health and Safety Committee (HSC) met on Monday, January 31, 2022, at 4:00 PM in the Rosa E. Blackwell Interactive Learning Center at the Cincinnati Public Schools Education Center, 2651 Burnet Avenue, 45219.

The public viewed the meeting via Video Conference.

ATTENDEES

Health and Safety Committee Members

Chairperson Mary Wineberg, Carolyn Jones; Kareem Moffett, Ph.D.

Administration/Staff

Tianay Amat, Interim Superintendent; Susan Bunte, Assistant Superintendent; Meg Burrows, Social Worker/School Culture and Safety; Dan Hoying, General Counsel; Connie Solano, Interim Chief Operations Officer

CPS Government Liaisons

Eric Kearney, CEO, Kearney and Kearney

Virtual Attendees: 6

Governmental Liaison Report on Particular and Immediate Legislative Topics

George Glover, Focused Capital Solutions; Eric Kearney, Kearney and Kearney

Mr. Kearney updated the Committee on the following January 31, 2022, Monthly Report.

Recent Issues

- * Bi-weekly meetings with Krista Boyle
- * Completed meeting with Board/Administration and Local Delegation
- * Completed meeting with Senator Blessing and tour of Gamble
- * Redistricting...Redistricting...Redistricting
- * H.B. 334 Pay increase for school board members
- * H.B. 441 Disclosure of COVID-19 vaccination status
- * H.B. 322 and H.B. 327 Critical Race Theory
- * S.B. 229 Blended learning model

Committee member Moffett inquired about the following bills. Mr. Kearney reported that bills with asterisks (*) designate that there is activity on the bill and that it may move forward.

ACTION: Mr. Kearney advised the Committee to let him know about which bills the Committee would like more information. He will submit an update to Board staff for submission to the Committee. He will provide the Committee with an update on other bills contained in his Monthly Report at the Health and Safety Committee meeting on February 28, 2022.

House Bills (HB)

- * H.B. 34 (Ingram) Require schools to transmit certain student's records within 5 days. Second Hearing on 2/16/21. Bill is of interest to CPS. May want to write a letter of support.
- * H.B. 73 (Manning, Crawley) To require school districts to form work groups to evaluate the amount of time students spend on testing, and to eliminate retention under the Third Grade Reading Guarantee.

*H.B. 170 (Bird, Richardson) To provide assistance to schools and other entities in response to the COVID 19 pandemic and to make an appropriation. First Hearing 3/9/21

* **(SB) Senate Bill 145** (Brenner)

- Revises the state report card system for school districts and other public schools beginning with the report card issued for the 2021-2022 school year.
- Maintains the A to F letter grade system, the overall summative grade, and individual letter grades for the components used to determine the overall grade.
- Maintains the six components prescribed under current law, but revises how they are graded individually, how they are used to calculate the overall grade, and, in some instances, renames them.
- Revises the performance measures that are used to determine component grades and eliminates separate letter grades for those measures.
- Requires A to F letter grades to be presented on the state report card with letter grade descriptions and prescribed graphics depicting grade scales and trends.

A copy of the full report is available upon request and in the Board office.

Committee member Jones recommended that the Board become more active at the State level and participate in public hearings due to various issues "on the table," e.g., Critical Race Theory.

Mr. Kearney reported that if there was a Bill that the Board or the Administration wanted to provide comment about, he would send a letter to the committee or if the Board wanted to testify, he would provide a date and time and make arrangements for testimony.

Connie Solano, Interim Chief Information Officer, updated the Committee on House Bill 110. Added to the Bill was a monetary penalty for public school districts that provide transportation to charter and non-public schools.

She reported that the Ohio Department of Education would hold funds from districts if the charter or non-public schools filed a complaint with the State and it was determined that those students did not receive transportation. She reported that several urban districts were found non-compliant in providing transportation for charters and non-charter schools.

Booster Research Update

Assistant Superintendent Bunte updated the Committee on responses to the below questions that the Committee submitted to Dr. Carl J. Fichtenbaum, University of Cincinnati Physician (responses attached).

1. Regarding boosters for our students who are eligible to receive, what is the value of receiving said shot and what are the effects of not receiving? Does the CDC still state that to be fully vaccinated you just need two shots?
2. Are we seeing big gaps in Cincinnati as it relates to students that fall in specific age groups that aren't already vaccinated? or vaccinated and still getting COVID?

3. Does science foresee this problem of unvaccinated/non-boosted kids causing long-term effects such as inflammatory problems, breathing issues, and even rising number of diabetics? What are specific risk factors that might be faced by children who are vaccinated or are boosted?
4. What are the likely immediate side effects for young people who are vaccinated/boosted?
5. Regarding boosters shots for adults, is there evidence of heightened protection/and or transmission of Omicron for those vaccinated vs those boosted?
6. Has there been any evidence of side effects presented by those boosted that were not present in those that were not boosted as it relates to adults?
7. What is the anticipated time frame that the booster shot will cover? For adults/kids?

ACTIONS: Committee member Jones advised the Administration to begin discussions with experts regarding a new variant that is surfacing.

Committee member Moffett advised the Administration to invite the appropriate physician to a Committee meeting to provide research data as it relates to mandating booster shots for adults and children.

Committee member Jones advised the Health and Safety Committee to work with the Policy and Equity Committee regarding boosters since they are also talking about this in their meetings. Committee member Moffett will inform the Committee as she is a member of that Committee.

Transportation – Bus Safety

Ms. Solano reported that bus safety is of utmost importance to the Cincinnati Public Schools Transportation Department. The transportation team communicates throughout the day with all yellow bus vendors to ensure safe arrival and departure of students. When a vendor becomes aware that their bus will not meet its scheduled time for pick-up or drop-off, a robocall is sent to parents and contact information is retrieved from PowerSchool. The school is also notified that the bus will be late.

Additionally, the Transportation Department receives a report on the number of attempts that are made to reach parents of students assigned to the late bus.

Ms. Solano reported as it relates to robocalls and limitations of systems when a lot of people are accessing the system at the same time, some of the calls get avoided, but that they do transmit. She also reported that some calls do not get transmitted due to an incorrect number or a block on the number.

Chairperson Wineberg inquired about the ability to text parents. Ms. Solano reported that texting is available and that parents' phones have to be set up to receive texts in order for the text to transmit.

Reports generated do not show that parents are actually receiving the texts, which is why the focus is more on robocalls.

ACTION: Dr. Moffett advised the Administration to look into phone numbers that are blocked from receiving texts. Ms. Solano reported that she would not be able to contact parents whose phones are set up to not accept text messages based on their phone plans.

ACTION: Ms. Solano will look into phone numbers that are blocked and reach out to parents in order to obtain updated contact numbers.

ACTION: Committee member Jones advised the Administration to provide the Committee with a short report every three months on the same bus routes that are late, as well as the same bus drivers that are late.

Bullying

Meg Burrows, Social Worker/School Culture and Safety, updated the Committee on: *Bullying Prevention, Reporting and Resolution* that is contained in her presentation (copy available in the Board Office).

Prevention

- Ongoing bullying prevention education and training for principals, staff, students and community members
- Individualized supports offered to schools
 - Meeting with principals
 - Safety planning with administration, families and students
 - Specialized presentation for areas of need
 - Community meetings and resource contacts
 - Sharing of resources for bullying preventions and positive school culture
 - Safety mapping for buildings
 - Cyber-bullying presentation shared with principals
 - Individualized presentations as requested by school
- Bullying Prevention in PBIS (Positive Behavior Interventions and Support) Planning and bi-annual work days
- Focused support for 4-8th grade girls across the district
 - Merged “We Care” groups with Girls to Women groups for greater support
 - Increased collaboration with Girls to Women, bullying prevention and education included in Fall and Spring events
 - Collaboration with community guest speaker for girls group, focusing on goal setting, confidence and bullying prevention

Reporting

Multiple ways to report bullying for guardians, students and community members

- Report directly to the school
- Report online, bullying notification button
- Call bullying prevention School Social Workers

Online Bullying Notification Button

- Floating button on CPS website and mobile app.
- Allows anyone to make a bullying report, may remain anonymous
- Every report that is made is followed up on by administration of the school and resolved using our online system
- FAQ’s and allegation forms are in 4 languages, including English, Spanish, French and Arabic
- System in place for quick translations of allegations so schools can investigate and support students
 - Bullying education with translators for parents at targeted schools.

Resolution

- Online resolution process for all bullying allegations
- Requires documentation for all action taken involving investigation and connecting interventions and consequences
- [AdminTracker](#) allows for schools to view school specific allegations and resolutions

Assistant Superintendent Bunte updated the Committee on Professional Development work that Positive School Culture is using for year 2021-2022 (full report contained in the presentation that is available upon request).

Topics include:

Bully Prevention, Intervention and Reporting

- Trauma Informed Educator Series

- SEL PD Day
- Code of Conduct/PBIS/Examining Equitable Practices
- Bully Prevention
- PBIS Work Sessions
- Mental Health First Aid (MHFA)
- How to respond to students presenting with mental health concerns
- Restorative Practices Training

Ms. Bunte also updated the Committee on the District’s following plan for Restorative Practices and reported that the work is grounded in PBIS.

A phased in approach for training and action planning will be conducted:

- Year 1- ALC Paraprofessionals and Promise Center Staff
- Year 2- Education Support Personnel and Building Teams
- Year 3- Building Teams

Building teams will focus on initial training, incorporation of Restorative Practices into the PBIS Plan, and planning for and executing restorative circles.

Assistant Superintendent Bunte reported Ohio Revised Code 3313.666 (B)(11) requires that the Administration semiannually “*provide the president of the district board a written summary of all reported incidents (of harassment, intimidation, and bullying) and (to) post the summary on its website.*”

Ms. Bunte provided the Committee with a copy of the semiannual Report on Bullying that will be provided to the Board (copy available in the Board office).

Ms. Burrows addressed Chairperson Wineberg’s questions regarding focused supports for 4th through 8th grade girls and boys across the District, if this is offered in different languages, and what supports are given to students being bullied.

Ms. Burrows also addressed Dr. Moffett’s question, “if there were any increases or decreases in cyber bullying, and how English Language Learners interpret bullying, do they report it and about the significant number of sustained cases contained in the semiannual bullying report.”

ACTION: Ms. Burrows will provide the Committee with more information about cyber bullying.

Committee member Jones congratulated Ms. Burrows on the work that she has done in incorporating positive intervention supports.

Student Conduct / Discipline Data Report

Assistant Superintendent Bunte updated the Committee on the following 2021-2022 Q1 Exclusionary Consequences Summary report.

Discipline Infractions Overall Comparison Q2 2018-19 v. Q2 2021-22

Quarter 2 Comparisons

School Year	Number of Infractions	Number of Schools
Q2 2018-19	7030	58
Q2 2021-22	7188	60

Quarter 2 Infractions by Race Q2 2018-19 v. Q2 2021-22

Quarter 2 Comparisons

By race	Q2 2018-19	Q2 2021-22
A	7	39
B	5,937	6,126
H	163	181
I	9	8
M	340	430
P	2	1
W	572	546
Grand Total	7,030	7,331

Areas that have shown improvement:

- Total Exclusionary Consequences have decreased from 4,192 02 2018 to 4,128 02 2021
- Exclusionary Consequences for Black students have decreased from 3,640 02 2018 to 3,502 02 2021

Exclusionary Consequences – SEL School Highlights

- QI SEL schools had a 17% reduction in exclusionary consequences in 02
- The goal is 20% reduction since the last full school year
 - QI SEL High Schools have reduced exclusionary consequences by more than 20% in 01 and 02
 - Though they have not met the 20% reduction goal, Elementary Schools are showing reduction in 01 and 02

Committee members expressed concern about the higher rates of African-American students being disciplined, if it's systemic and what is driving the numbers. Ms. Bunte reported that the Administration worked with Georgetown University for the past two years on the disproportionality issue.

ACTION: The Committee advised the Administration to provide data on discipline data per school, gender, grade levels and an aggressive plan beyond 20 percent reduction that is stated in the report. The Committee will review data then present it to the full Board for discussion.

COVID-19

Cleaning and Ventilation in Buildings

Ms. Solano presented the following memo to update the Committee about cleaning and ventilation in the school buildings.

In preparation for in-person instruction on January 24, 2022, all areas in school buildings were cleaned, disinfected and treated with the Clorox 360 electrostatic sprayer. COVID cleaning continues daily in CPS schools.

MERV 13 HVAC filters will be phased in as the District's current inventory of MERV 10 and MERV 11 is depleted. MERV 13 filters can trap smaller particles than MERV 10 and 11.

Vollara Air and Surface Pro air purifiers were installed in all preschool classrooms, specialized classroom and the Hyde Park School trailers. These are purifiers contain HEPA filters.

Ms. Solano reported that N95 masks arrived and a training video on how to wear the mask will be sent out on February 1, 2022. Training is required because the mask is a respirator. She also stated that there is not a mandate to wear the mask.

Committee member Moffett recommended that building principals and assistant principals be provided with the N95 masks.

ACTION: The Committee agreed with the recommendation, but would like to discuss the matter with the full Board.

2022 Committee Workplan

Ms. Bunte did a review of the 2021 Workplan that is aligned to the Board's Strategic Plan – Goals, Strategies and Outcomes.

The Committee reviewed and updated the Workplan for year 2022 and recommended to include the following topics in the document:

- Athletic Safety
- Dating Violence
- Menstrual Health for Girls
- Student Resource Offices (SRO)
 - Status update at February 28 HSC Meeting
- Student Based Health Centers – Dental, Hearing and Vision

The Plan will also include which administrator will present the workplan topics.

The Committee discussed the request by “Moms Demand Action” to discuss Gun Safety at a Health and Safety Committee meeting. The Committee also agreed to let the organization present at a future Committee meeting since they had already been given the okay to present.

The Committee discussed the need to have a process when community organizations request to present at committee and full Board meetings, and which committees will present topics requested.

ACTION: The Committee will discuss the process for community organizations requesting to present at full Board and committee meetings at a Regular Business meeting under Board Matters

Ms. Bunte informed the Committee that Strategic Outcomes: Measures 2B, 2C, 2D and 3A, contained in the workplan were met. She will follow-up with Interim Superintendent Amat regarding the status of Measure 2A and 3A.

Tracking Attendees: Virtual / In Person

The Committee discussed tracking the number of participants attending HSC meetings either in-person or virtually, and collect emails and phone numbers. The goal is to send updates to the community about Board and committee meetings as well as tracking the number of people attending those meetings.

Robert Wilson, Information Technology Consultant, reported that information can be captured through the chat feature on Blue Jeans, and that emails are not required to be submitted. He also stated that information submitted may not be true to the person submitting data (e.g., submitting wrong name).

An attendance report for virtual meetings can be generated by the district's Network Manager. The report does include a section to add an email address per the attendees' discretion.

ACTION: The Committee will recommend to the Board to begin instructing the community on where to find information about Board meetings (e.g., minutes from Board meetings) and how to access the closed-captioning feature.

Other Business

Employee Fitness Center Safety

As the Fitness Center is unlocked, the Committee inquired about the possibility of using employee badges for entry into the Fitness Center and shower rooms in order to make it safer for employees using those areas.

ACTION: Interim Superintendent Amat advised Ms. Solano to work with Information Technology and Security to have something installed.

Hearing of the Public

There were no speakers for Hearing the Public.

The meeting adjourned at 5:41 pm

Health and Safety Committee

Mary Wineberg, Chair
Carolyn Jones
Kareem Moffett, Ph.D.

Staff Liaisons

Tianay Amat, Interim Superintendent
Susan Bunte, Assistant Superintendent
Connie Solano, Interim Chief Operations Officer



To: Cincinnati Public Schools Board Members
From: Susan Bunte, Assistant Superintendent
Date: Monday, January 31, 2022
Re: COVID Booster

- 1. Regarding boosters for our students who are eligible to receive, what is the value of receiving said shot and what are the effects of not receiving? Does the CDC still state that to be fully vaccinated you just need two shots?**

In persons that have never been infected with COVID but receive 2 vaccinations, the level of protection against the newer variants like Omicron is less. If you had COVID before and you got full vaccination series (Pfizer or Moderna) you should have adequate protection. A booster dose will help to remind your immune system and increase the level of immunity allowing more protection. There is no disadvantage to receiving a booster as there are no increase in risks. So, receiving a booster vaccination ensures the maximum protection from current circulating variants of COVID. The CDC guidelines indicate that completion of vaccination requires 2 doses of Moderna or Pfizer vaccine. The booster is recommended for ages 12 and up with Pfizer and 18 and older with Moderna. This is key right now that many children in school cannot receive a booster (ONLY THOSE WHO GOT PFIZER AND ARE 12 YEARS of Age or older).

- 2. Are we seeing big gaps in Cincinnati as it relates to students that fall in specific age groups that aren't already vaccinated? or vaccinated and still getting COVID?**

According to the Ohio Department of Health, 29% of children ages 5-11 and 55% ages 12-17 have receiving COVID vaccination in Hamilton County. For Butler county the numbers are 24% and 50% in the same age groups; and for Clermont County the numbers are 22% and 48% respectively. So, yes, we are seeing very low numbers of vaccination. Compare this to regular childhood vaccinations that have successfully prevented many diseases and saved lives – 95%+ vaccinated fully.

- 3. Does science foresee this problem of unvaccinated/ non boosted kids causing long term effects such inflammatory problems, breathing issues, and even rising number of diabetics? What are specific risk factors that might be faced by children who are vaccinated or are boosted?**

The question is that if you are not vaccinated, what are the risks of developing serious COVID disease or longer-term effects from COVID? This depends, in part, on the child. If they have some underlying health conditions, their risk may be higher. For the most part, few children die from COVID <0.01%; about 1% of children may be hospitalized with COVID; 1-10% of children may have short-term problems from COVID like concentration issues, breathing issues, etc. that typically resolve within a few months; about 0.1-1% of children will have more serious long-term problems with COVID like

inflammatory syndrome, heart problems (myocarditis), etc. More serious side effects from vaccination occur in <0.001% of children (about 1 in 10,000 to 100,000 roughly).

On balance, most pediatricians and physicians recommend vaccination over the disease because numerically the virus causes more problems than the vaccine, on average.

4. What are the likely immediate side effects for young people who are vaccinated/boosted?

For vaccination, 80% of children will have side effects the first 2 days after vaccination (sore arm, achy feeling, etc.). Most of these side effects are mild and don't interfere with life activities. In the studies, the most common effects were sore arm followed by achiness, chills, muscle soreness. These effects are your immune system responding to the foreign virus material in the vaccine with building immunity in the body. There are proteins and compounds produced that sometimes make a person feel sick (similar to when you get a cold).

5. Regarding booster shots for adults is there evidence of heightened protection/and or transmission of Omicron for those vaccinated vs those boosted?

If you had 3 shots of Moderna or Pfizer, there is strong evidence that the risk of being hospitalized or dying is dramatically reduced with the Omicron variant 95-100% protection in some studies. It looks like about 2/3 of persons exposed to Omicron who are fully vaccinated and boosted may still be infected. The infection is typically mild and the amount of virus being produced is generally lower than those who are not fully vaccinated or boosted. The specifics of how effective it is in preventing transmission are still being studied and the answer is not known. There is no evidence that being vaccinated or receiving a booster vaccine increases the chance of transmission of Omicron. The level of protection is lower in those that were vaccinated 6 months before coming in contact with Omicron (have not received a booster). Bottom line: Vaccines are built to protect people from disease NOT infection. Polio vaccines do not prevent polio infection 100% but they prevent people from becoming paralyzed. That is how all of our vaccines are designed for the past 70+ years.

6. Has there been any evidence of side effects presented by those boosted that were not present in those that were not boosted as it relates to adults?

There are no additional serious side effects. The immediate side effects in the first 2 days may be a little more severe with a booster. For example, fever, muscle aches and chills occur at higher rates 1/3 to 2/3's of those getting a booster. Again, these usually resolve in 1-2 days.

7. What is the anticipated time frame that the booster shot will cover? For adults/kids?

Vaccination with Pfizer or Moderna with 2 doses provides reasonable protection for about 6 months then starts to drop particularly if you are exposed to the Omicron variant. Boosters help to prolong protection but the length of time of that protection is not known since we have not experienced another "wave" of infection anywhere in the world. So, we do not know how long protection will last with a booster. My best guess is that optimal protection using the current vaccines will likely require an annual vaccine like influenza. This is not surprising since our immune systems work best when they are trained to be ready. Much like practicing a musical instrument or practicing sports helps you get better at those things, providing immune reminders helps our immune systems protect us better.