

BOARD OF EDUCATION

CINCINNATI, OHIO

PROCEEDINGS

SPECIAL PUBLIC MEETING

April 22, 2009

Table of Contents

Roll Call	238
Hearing the Public	238
Presentation	238
Resolution To Execute Contracts For Transportation Of Yellow Bus Services With First Student And Petermann	238
Resolution To Execute A Contract For Transportation Of Yellow Bus Service With First Student	239
Adjournment	240

SPECIAL PUBLIC MEETING

The Board of Education of the City School District of the City of Cincinnati, Ohio, met in special public session pursuant to notice by the Treasurer in Conference Room 1A, 2651 Burnet Avenue, Wednesday, April 22, 2009 at 4:04 p.m. President Reed in the chair. The pledge to the flag was led by President Reed.

ROLL CALL

Present: Members Bates, Bolton, Cranley, Flannery, Ingram, Nelms, President Reed (7)

Superintendent Ronan was present.

HEARING THE PUBLIC

The following persons addressed the Board regarding the topics indicated:

Mark Herington	- Yellow Bus Service
David Duke	- Yellow Bus Service
Pete Settles	- Yellow Bus Service
Rebecca Campbell	- Yellow Bus Service
Susan Cross	- Yellow Bus Service
Dave Gilligan	- Yellow Bus Service

PRESENTATION

Transportation Services – Michael Dresch, Director of Transportation

RESOLUTION TO EXECUTE CONTRACTS FOR TRANSPORTATION OF YELLOW BUS SERVICES WITH FIRST STUDENT AND PETERMANN

WHEREAS, the Cincinnati (City) School District contracts Yellow Bus Transportation; and

WHEREAS, the current Yellow Bus contracts expire June 30, 2009; and

WHEREAS, the Cincinnati (City) School District's Finance Committee has considered the results of a competitive bid process.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, That the Pupil Transportation Department execute a contract with First Student, Inc. and Petermann for Yellow Bus Transportation Services, for period July 1, 2009 through June 30, 2014, at a cost not to exceed \$99,000,000. Funding is from the general fund.

Catherine D. Ingram

Ms. Ingram moved and Ms. Bolton seconded the motion that the Resolution To Execute Contracts For Transportation Of Yellow Bus Services With First Student And Petermann be approved

Ayes: Bolton, Ingram (2)

Noes: Bates, Cranley, Flannery, Nelms, President Reed (5)

President Reed declared the motion failed.

Review of the Bid Proposals for Pupil Transportation

One-half	<u>Double Vendor</u>		-	<u>Double Vendor</u>		Difference
	First Student	Petermann		First Student	Durham	
	\$99,435,277	\$98,541,120		\$99,435,277	\$96,292,263	
	\$49,717,638	\$49,270,560		\$49,717,638	\$48,146,132	
Combined 5 year Cost		\$98,988,199			\$97,863,770	\$1,124,429

<u>Single Vendor</u>		
First Student	Petermann	
\$92,812,646	\$93,138,658	
-\$2,500,000	-\$3,125,000	Guaranteed Route Savings
-\$175,000		VersaTrans maintenance fee \$35,000 for 5 yrs
\$90,137,646	\$90,013,658	
<u>Additional Impact if Single Vendor</u>		
First Student	Petermann	
\$60,000	will fund, no \$	Route efficiency study
\$500,000		\$100,000 Yearly Sponsorship involvement
256	144	New buses first year resulting in better reliability and emissions

Current Contract Annual Cost	\$20,319,190
5 year cost	\$101,595,948

<u>Cost Conclusion</u>	<u>Savings</u>
-	Over Five Years
Single First Student versus First Student/Petermann Double	\$8,850,552
Single First Student versus First Student/Durham Double	\$7,726,124
Single First Student versus current contract cost	\$11,458,302
Double First Student/Petermann versus current contract cost	\$9,396,389

Evaluation based on the following criteria:

- Cost
- Reliability and past performance
- Demonstration of superior customer service

- Diversity, both internal staffing as well as inclusion of qualified minority and women-owned businesses
- Proposed methodology
- Demonstration of creativity and flexibility

<u>Single Vendor</u>	Rank
First Student	1
Petermann	2

<u>Double Vendor</u>	Rank
First Student	1
Durham	2
Petermann	3

**RESOLUTION TO EXECUTE A CONTRACT FOR
TRANSPORTATION OF YELLOW BUS SERVICE WITH
FIRST STUDENT**

WHEREAS, the Cincinnati (City) School District contracts Yellow Bus Transportation; and

WHEREAS, the current Yellow Bus contracts expire June 30, 2009; and

WHEREAS, the Cincinnati (City) School District's Finance Committee has considered the results of a competitive bid process.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, That the Pupil Transportation Department execute a contract with the First Student, Inc. for Yellow Bus Transportation Services, for period July 1, 2009 through June 30, 2014, at a cost not to exceed \$91,000,000. Funding is from the general fund.

Melaine Bates

Mrs. Bates moved and Mrs. Cranley seconded the motion that the Resolution To Execute A Contract For Transportation Of Yellow Bus Service With First Student be approved.

Ayes: Bates, Cranley, Flannery, President Reed (4)

Noes: Bolton, Ingram, Nelms (3)

President Reed declared the motion carried.

Review of the Bid Proposals for Pupil Transportation

<u>Double Vendor</u>		-	<u>Double Vendor</u>		
First Student	Petermann		First Student	Durham	
\$99,435,277	\$98,541,120		\$99,435,277	\$96,292,263	
One-half	\$49,717,638	\$49,270,560	\$49,717,638	\$48,146,132	
Combined 5 year Cost	\$98,988,199		\$97,863,770		Difference \$1,124,429
<u>Single Vendor</u>					
First Student	Petermann				
\$92,812,646	\$93,138,658				
-\$2,500,000	-\$3,125,000	Guaranteed Route Savings			
-\$175,000		VersaTrans maintenance fee \$35,000 for 5 yrs			
\$90,137,646	\$90,013,658				
<u>Additional Impact if Single Vendor</u>					
First Student	Petermann				
\$60,000	will fund, no \$	Route efficiency study			
\$500,000		\$100,000 Yearly Sponsorship involvement			
256	144	New buses first year resulting in better reliability and emissions			

Current Contract Annual Cost	\$20,319,190
5 year cost	\$101,595,948

<u>Cost Conclusion</u>	<u>Savings</u>
	Over Five Years
Single First Student versus First Student/Petermann Double	\$8,850,552
Single First Student versus First Student/Durham Double	\$7,726,124
Single First Student versus current contract cost	\$11,458,302
Double First Student/Petermann versus current contract cost	\$9,396,389
<u>Evaluation based on the following criteria:</u>	
Cost	
Reliability and past performance	
Demonstration of superior customer service	
Demonstrated experience and ability to assist with the management and execution of service of this scope	
Diversity, both internal staffing as well as inclusion of qualified minority and women-owned businesses	
Proposed methodology	
Demonstration of creativity and flexibility	
<u>Single Vendor</u>	Rank
First Student	1
Petermann	2
<u>Double Vendor</u>	
First Student	1
Durham	2
Petermann	3

ADJOURNMENT

The Board adjourned at 5:25 p.m.

Jonathan L. Boyd
Treasurer/CFO

